

# Translation and National Literary Style Reforms: An Analysis of the Relay Translation of “The Californian’s Tale”

Li Xuezhao

(The Ohio State University)

## Abstract:

From “The Californian’s Tale” to “Mountain People’s Love” to “Adventures in the Mountains”, the relay translation of this short story linked together style reforms in America, Japan, and China. In this process, translation was connected with style reform in different ways. Hara Hōitsuan translated Mark Twain’s revolutionary “colloquial style” into the relatively conservative “detailed style” at a time when detailed style was faced with increasing challenges from newer styles. The anachronism of his translation in the context of radical style reform led to a significant cultural event in Japan’s modern history: the “mistranslation debate.” Wu Tao created the “new vernacular style” based on the literal translation of detailed style. While it also departed from the original style, his choice of style set the trend for Chinese style reform. It showed how Japanese functioned as an intermediary in the Europeanization of Chinese language and how relay translation through Japanese contributed to modern Chinese style reform.

**Keywords:** style reform, relay translation, “The Californian’s Tale”, Mark Twain, Hara Hōitsuan, Wu Tao

---

The translation of Western literature, especially English literature, played an important role in the literary style reforms in modern China and Japan since Europeanization was a common trend for both modern Chinese and Japanese. This generalization is true when we look at the overall evolution of modern Chinese and Japanese languages. However, if we focus on a particular translator or translated text, it can be seen that for some Chinese and Japanese translators, Europeanized style was not a necessary option. Moreover, literary style could even

be far from being their major concern in a translation. In fact, most translators in modern China or Japan failed to represent the original style of the source text in translation because they had either no intention or lacked the abilities to do so. It is understandable that to represent the original style was a nearly unreasonable requirement for translators when there were still no universal fixed linguistic norms of literary translation and even literary writing in their times. In Meiji Japan or the late Qing and early Republican China, literary styles were changing dramatically and several transitional forms of writing coexisted during these periods. Therefore, in the study of modern Japanese and Chinese literary translation, in comparison with simply making judgments about whether the original style is represented in the translation or not, it will be more meaningful to pay closer attention to the reasons for the translators' stylistic choices and to understand their choices in the context of the different national literary style reforms linked by translation activities, as studied in this paper.

The relay translation of Mark Twain's short story "The Californian's Tale" (1893) strung together different literary style reforms from America, Japan and China in late nineteenth and early twentieth century. In this process, three different writing styles from different languages encountered and influenced one another. It also revealed how translation and style reforms could interact with each other in different ways. "The Californian's Tale" was firstly translated into Japanese by Hara Hōitsuan<sup>1</sup> as "Mountain People's Love" (Yamaga no koi) and was published in the magazine *The Sun* (Taiyō) in 1903. Chinese translator Wu Tao translated "Mountain People's Love" into Chinese as "Adventures in the Mountains" (Shanjia qiyu) which was published in the magazine *Tapestry Portrait Novel* (Xiuxiang xiaoshuo) in 1906. From "The Californian's Tale" to "Mountain People's Love" to "Adventures in the Mountains", this short story changed its writing style every time it crossed the linguistic boundaries through translation: from "colloquial style" to "detailed style" (Shūmitsu buntai) to "new vernacular style" (Xin baihua wenti).

### Mark Twain and the Colloquial Style

Faulkner once called Mark Twain the father of American literature because he was the first American writer to forge a writing style out of actual American

1 "Mountain People's Love" was published under Hara Hōitsuan's pen name "The owner of Hōitsu hut" (Hōitsuan Shujin).

colloquial speech. He made it possible for American literature to establish its own identity and differentiate itself from European literature in the sense of language and style. In doing so, he contributed to the reform of American literary style. In previous studies of Mark Twain's colloquial style, the novel *Adventures of Huckleberry Finn* is often seen as a representative work (Bridgman 78; Trilling 104). In comparison, the style of "The Californian's Tale" seems relatively plain. But we can still see basic characteristics of the colloquial style in the text of this story.

A colloquial style of writing is one style which conveys the effects of informal spoken language. The linguistic stylist Richard Bridgman lists "stress on the individual verbal unit, a resulting fragmentation of syntax, and the use of repetition to bind and unify" (12) as the three key characteristics of the colloquial style. Lionel Trilling argues that a colloquial style is not a matter of pronunciation or of grammar, but rather "has something to do with ease and freedom in the use of language. Most of all it has to do with the structure of the sentence, which is simple, direct, and fluent, maintaining the rhythm of the word-groups of speech and the intonations of the speaking voice" (116). Malcolm Cowley highlights the key features of colloquial writing as having a simpler diction, looser sentence structure, a tendency on the part of the narrator to combine flat assertions with striking physical images, and an increased use of intensifying adverbs (3-14).

If we condense the three stylists' conclusions together, we see that fragmentation and repetition are essential to colloquial writing. They are also the two major linguistic features of the text of "The Californian's Tale." In this text, fragmentation of sentences firstly consists in the listing of things in a disordered way. Secondly, as Cowley and Trilling point out, short sentences and simple structures are common to colloquial writing which mimics the patterns of speech. Some of these sentences are formed by cutting long sentences with loose structures into short sections. As for patterns of repetition, they frequently appear in syllables, words and sentences.

The narrator's description of the host Henry's bedroom is just one example of a single run-on sentence far more reminiscent of oral communication than the detailed prose one would expect:

such a bedroom as I had not seen for years: white counterpane, white pillows, carpeted floor, papered walls, pictures, dressing-table, with mirror and pin-cushion and dainty toilet things; and in the corner a wash-stand, with real chinaware bowl and pitcher, and with soap in a china dish, and on a rack more than a dozen towels. . . (Twain, "The Californian's Tale" 268)

It merely lists off the things found in the room with only a few prepositions to indicate the spatial relationships between these objects and their locations in the room. The description is fragmented in such a way that it can only convey the most basic information. People can hardly form any detailed picture of the room in their minds when they read this paragraph. Normally, oral communication is aimed at conveying basic information just like the existence of certain objects as shown in this paragraph while literary writing tends to use modifiers or add details to distinguish itself from everyday speech. By deliberately fragmenting the syntax, Mark Twain created a colloquial style that is more intimate for readers, a style which is similar to that of a conversation between friends.

Mark Twain's obvious preference for short sentences results in the other form of fragmentation. He cut many long sentences artificially into small segments by the use of punctuation, conjunctions or discourse markers. This feature is typically shown in dialogues like the following:

You see, she likes to have people come and stop with us-- people who know things, and can talk--people like you. She delights in it; for she knows--oh, she knows nearly everything herself, and can talk, oh, like a bird. Don't go; it's only a little while, you know, and she'll be so disappointed. (Twain, "The Californian's Tale" 269)

The host Henry is trying to persuade "me" to stay at his place to wait for his wife to come back. The whole paragraph comprises two types of sentences: simple sentences and sections of long sentences. Twain made the deliberate choice to take one sentence like "She delights in it because she knows nearly everything and she can talk like a bird" and to transform it into something more hesitant through the use of discourse markers and repetition. Furthermore, the cohesion is disrupted through the insertion of unnecessary punctuations like commas, dashes, conjunctions like "and", "for", discourse markers like "oh". This results in Henry saying, "She delights in it; for she knows--oh, she knows nearly everything herself, and can talk, oh, like a bird." Along with the use of the interjections "you see," "you know," the fragmentary expression imitates Henry's speech with constant pauses. The constant pauses and the repeated use of words like "oh" convey Henry's anxious tone when he is eager to stop "me" from leaving.

Repetition is used to bind and unify broken sentences that are caused by fragmentation and loose structures. In this way the consistency and coherence of

writing can be restored. Repetition in the text of “The Californian’s Tale” can be seen from syllables to words, to phrases and even to sentences. Firstly, we can see the repetition of words in the following paragraph where Henry praises his wife’s special skills in housekeeping:

She always does that. You can’t tell just what it lacks, but it does lack something until you’ve done that—you can see it yourself after it’s done, but that is all you know; you can’t find out the law of it...though I don’t know the law of any of them. But she knows the law. She knows the why and the how both; but I don’t know the why; I only know the how. (Twain, “The Californian’s Tale” 267-268)

In this paragraph, words like “does,” “done,” “don’t,” “lack,” “know,” and noun phrases such as “the law,” “the why,” and “the how” all appear at least twice. Repetition tends to happen immediately in the next sentence, thus creating connection in meaning and prosody between two sentences. The repetition of simple words in such a short passage also indicates Henry’s limited vocabulary, revealing the low educational attainment of a miner like him.

Repetition in the syllable level is shown in the alliteration, rhyme, prefix and suffix of words. The opening paragraph of this text is an example of repetition in the suffix of words:

Thirty-five years ago I was out prospecting on the Stanislaus, tramping all day long with pick and pan and horn, and washing a hatful of dirt here and there, always expecting to make a rich strike, and never doing it. (Twain, “The Californian’s Tale” 266)

We can see that the suffix “-ing” repeatedly appear in the words “prospecting,” “tramping,” “washing,” “expecting” and “doing.” The repeated use of the continuous tense conveys a sense of constantly trying despite fruitless results. It shows the narrator’s perpetual passion and great patience for gold panning. In addition, a certain prosodic structure is loosely formed by the repetition of syllables. Rather than the formal metrical system of poems, this prosodic structure is so simple that it is closer to a casual word play in speech.

Repetition also conveys an emphasis on certain important points embedded in the seemingly loose structures and casual speech of the texts. It is typically shown in the repeated sentences, which have relatively complete expression of

meaning compared to words or phrases. The sentence “All her work, she did it all herself—every bit” (Twain, “The Californian’s Tale” 267) is said twice when Henry is leading the narrator around his house. Henry’s repeated praise for his wife contributes to the shaping of the hostess’s image as a good housewife and conveys his love for her.

From my understanding of this short story, the ideal image of the missing hostess is, for the frustrated miners, a metaphor for the beautiful past, which partly explains Henry’s and the other characters’ love for the hostess. The repetition of this sentence is not a coincidence but has close relation to the central theme of the story: criticism about the cruel gold rush which left miners with nothing but illusions of the idealized past.

### **Hara Hōitsuan and the Detailed Style**

Before we discuss Hara Hōitsuan’s translation of “The Californian’s Tale,” we will first touch upon the different translation styles popular in Japan since Meiji era in order to contextualize his choice of the detailed style.

Detailed style is defined as “delineat[ing] or narrat[ing] something, usually some daily trivialities or one’s inner world, in a detailed way. Even if it is to describe the heaven and earth, the mountains and rivers, the nation and the society, the description should still be exquisite” (Yanagida 428). Japanese detailed style is close to the style of Chinese prose in Ming and Qing dynasties. The detailed style used in translation is also called “the literal translation of Western writing in the style of Chinese writing” (Kanbunchō ōbun chokuyakutai), which is “a kind of writing style used in literal translation, based on Chinese words and added with Western-language grammatical elements like nominative and objective cases” (Takahashi 557). By using a foundation of detailed Chinese writing, it overcomes the crudity of “the style of reading Chinese writing in Japanese” (Kanbun kundokutai) and absorbs the rigorousness and precision from Western-language writing through literal translation.

The history of Japanese modern literary translation could be divided into three periods according to its writing style: In the first ten years of Meiji era (1868-1877), most translators used “Chinese writing style” (Kanbuntai), “the mixing style of the elegant and the colloquial” (Gazoku setchūtai) and “the colloquial style” (Zokutai) to do free translation like paraphrasing or introducing the main plots of the original texts. Between the eleventh and seventeenth year of the Meiji period (1878-1884), word-for-word translation grew popular. The main translation style was “the style

of literal translation of Chinese writing” (Kanbun chokuyakutai), also known as “the style of reading Chinese writing in Japanese”. With the development of the literal translation method, “the style of literal translation of Western writing” (Ōbun chokuyakutai) gained popularity after the eighteenth year of the Meiji era (1885). Morita Shiken created the “detailed style” through the combination of “Chinese writing style” and “the style of literal translation of Western writing”. Futabatei Shimei went further in his use of the “the style of unification of writing and speech” (Genbun itchitai) in translation. Therefore, according to the chronological order of these styles, the “detailed style” has more syntactical elements borrowed from Western writing compared with “the style of reading Chinese writing in Japanese” but also maintains the style of Chinese writing to certain extent, which makes it less flexible and colloquial than “the style of unification of writing and speech”. As said by Yanagida Izumi, “texts in the detailed style look rather dense and awkward today” (9) because of its overreliance on Chinese writing. Hara Hōitsuan’s translation of “The Californian’s Tale,” “Mountain People’s Love” was written in the “detailed style” inherited from his teacher Morita Shiken, who was recognized as “the king of translation” in the Meiji era, also called by Yanagida Izumi as the “finisher” (428) of the detailed style.

The style of Hara Hōitsuan’s translation is grave and detailed. “Mountain People’s Love” has two obvious typical features of the detailed style: The Chinese writing style is shown in its large proportion of Chinese characters, conjunctions and the forms of its sentence endings. The writing style is detailed, with large amounts of modifiers added to exemplify the exquisite description that Yanagida calls for.

Firstly, there are large numbers of difficult Chinese characters in the translated text: 「獨棲」(Dokusei), 「際會」(Saikai), 「瓦破」(Gaha), 「一躰」(Ittai), 「挨拶」(Aisatsu), 「颯然」(Souzen), 「讚歎」(Santan), 「煖爐」(Danro), 「無寐」(Bushitsuke), 「差支」(Sashi), 「凝手」(Gyoushu), 「懇親」(Gonshin), 「筭」(Hazu), 「豫定」(Yotei) and 「畢變」(Hihhen). These words are obviously inherited from Japanese traditional kanbun writing. The use of conjunction words like 「然し」(Shikashi), 「而し」(Shikashi), 「斯て」(Kakute), 「然らば」(Saraba) and 「然れども」(Saredomo) also reveals a distinct Chinese writing style.

One important marker for the style of Japanese writing is its use of auxiliary words in the sentence endings. For kanbuntai, auxiliary words in sentence endings are very limited: tense indicators are restricted and other types of indicators are rarely used (Mizuno 5). It can be considered similar to Chinese writing in that temporal reference is attained through meaning rather than morphological changes

(Kaji 123). In writings using kanbun kundokutai style, auxiliary suffixes used to indicate the past or perfect tense are normally restricted to 「き」 (-ki), 「たり」 (-tari), 「り」 (-ri), 「けり」 (-keri), 「つ」 (-tsu), and 「ぬ」 (-nu). In “Mountain People’s Love” written in the detailed style, the categories of auxiliary words are still limited although compared with kanbun kundokutai, the use of 「し」 (shi) 「ぬ」 (nu) 「のみ」 (nomi) increases. Most sentences end with 「き」 「り」 「たり」 in a rather monotonous way.

It is intriguing that Hara Hōitsuan used the detailed style to translate a short story written in an American colloquial style. The detailed style calls for detailed writing with relatively complete or rigorous sentence structures while Mark Twain’s colloquial style has concise expression and casual speech as exemplified by the list of things in environmental descriptions. In order to fulfill the requirements of the detailed style, Hara Hōitsuan made some changes to the original text in his translation. He added modifiers to the object nouns, supplemented nouns with verbs to specify the actions and gave information about the localities or order of things to help readers to form a clearer picture of the scenes. These changes can be witnessed by a comparison of the original and translated texts of the following paragraph.

Thirty-five years ago I was out prospecting on the Stanislaus, tramping all day long with pick and pan and horn, washing a hatful of dirt here and there, always expecting to make a rich strike, and never doing it. (Twain, “The Californian’s Tale” 266)

今より三十五年前、余は鶴嘴を肩にし鐵葉鍋を腰に着け、木の根を掘り岩角を碎き、土砂の一と握を掬ひては分拆し、今にも目覚ましき金塊に探り當ることもやと欲望を燃しつゝ、カリホルニヤとオレゴンの間なる緑山の峽間杣道を日又日辿り暮らしたることありき...(Twain, “Mountain People’s Love” 275)

In the original text, “pick,” “pan,” and “horn” are simply modified with one preposition “with.” By contrast, in the translated text, “put on the shoulder” (肩にし Katanishi) is added to modify “pick” (鶴嘴 Tsuruhashi) and similarly, “carry at the waist” (腰に着け Koshi ni tsuke) is added to “pan” (鐵葉鍋 Tehhanabe). While it deviates from Twain’s original, Hara Hōitsuan’s decision to include active verbs and the locations of the things makes the description more vivid.



## Mistranslation Debate and Style Consciousness

The contrast between detailed style and colloquial style indicates that Hara Hōitsuan was not conscious of the original style. In his late years, he admitted that he had failed to grasp the unique style of Mark Twain's writing. In May of 1904, he looked back on all of his translations of Mark Twain's works in the foreword of "A Strange Story on the Foot of the Rocky Mountains" (Rokkīmaunten no shita no kimyō na hanashi)<sup>2</sup>: "I read Mr. Twain's twenty-eight works and translated seven of them. However, I turned a blind eye to the real essence of his writing..." (Twain 296). This penitent tone was quite different from his attitudes in another commentary on Mark Twain about one year earlier. He said in the foreword of one translation called "Advice" (Jogen)<sup>3</sup>: "American Twain.....whose thinking is not mature enough and writing not fine enough.....has not become a major character in the literary holy ground" (Twain 128). "Advice" was published less than a year earlier than "A Strange Story on the Foot of the Rocky Mountains" and the dramatic shift in his opinions of Mark Twain's writing is more than evident. His change in opinion was a direct result of the "mistranslation debate," an important event in the translation history of Meiji era. Hara Hōitsuan was one of the chief participants in this event.

Hara Hōitsuan (1866-1904), original name was Hara Yosaburō, was a renowned translator in the Meiji era. He used the detailed style inherited from his teacher Morita Shiken to translate a large number of works of detective fiction and children's literature. His translations were popular among readers at the time. He initially gained fame through a translated novel called *Saint or Bandit* (Seijin ka tōzoku ka)<sup>4</sup> which was serialized in *Tokyo Asahi Shimbun* (Tōkyō asahi shinbun) from March 15<sup>th</sup> to November 15<sup>th</sup> in 1900, and which was later published as a two-volume offprint in 1903. The prologues and postscripts of the novel came from forty-seven famous writers including Yano Ryūkei and Mori Ōgai. It indicates that Hara Hōitsuan's talent for translation achieved widespread recognition from other distinguished men of letters.

However, in the same year (1903), the event which turned out to be the turning point of his career happened. It started with a letter from a critic named Yamagata

2 Translated from Mark Twain's "A Double-Barreled Detective Story", originally published in *Literary World* (Bungeikai) in December of 1904.

3 Translated from Mark Twain's "Aurelia's Unfortunate Young Man", originally published in the *Asahi Shimbun* on March 30<sup>th</sup> of 1903.

4 Translated from Edward Bulwer-Lytton's novel *Eugene Aram*.

Isō. As the head of the English column of *Yorozu Morning Paper* (Yorozu chōhō), Yamagata Isō was proficient in English. He wrote to Hara Hōitsuan with the following comments on Hara's translation "The Killing of Caesar" (Shizā zansatsu jiken)<sup>5</sup>: "Your grave and rigorous writing style...is not appropriate for the translation of Mark Twain's works in a humorous and free style" (Twain 241). He questioned Hara's choice of style in translation by pointing out the difference between the styles of Hara's translation and Twain's writing. Hara defended himself in his reply and then Yamagata debated with him again. Their correspondence was published in the newspaper, attracting widespread attention from the public. After several rounds of debates, the whole issue escalated into the exposure of Hara Hōitsuan's "mistranslation." Yamagata Isō accused Hara of making several mistranslations by providing his own word-for-word retranslation of "The Killing of Julius Caesar 'Localized.'" The "mistranslation debate" was a huge blow to both Hara Hōitsuan's inner confidence and external reputation. Soon his translation career and even his life came to an end. He died in a psychiatric hospital in August 1904. As said by Kawato Michiaki, the death of Hara Hōitsuan did not only mean the end of his individual literary career, but also marked the end of the literary school represented by him. It indicated that the detailed style as a unique style of translated literature had finally withered away faced with the critique from the rising forces of new translation methods and styles (351).

The "mistranslation debate" was not just a debate on the translation method (literal or free translation). It is worthy of note that this debate started from a controversy over the translator's choice of writing style. Yamagata Isō had been right to point out that Hara Hōitsuan lacked awareness of the style of the original text. In fact, he just did not care much about accurately representing the style of other authors. He chose the detailed style to cater to the tastes of readers rather than as a reflection of his judgement about an original style. At the time, the detailed style created by his teacher Morita Shiken was already very popular among readers. Hara Hōitsuan followed his teacher's lead and his translation also gained widespread popularity amongst the public and earned him enormous fame.

However, at the beginning of the twentieth century, the detailed style, which was close to the style of Chinese prose writing, was faced with more and more challenges from the ongoing writing style reform. There appeared other styles of writing that were closer to speech and more appropriate for the literal translation of modern English-language literature, such as "the style of unification of writing and

5 Translated from Mark Twain's "The Killing of Julius Caesar Localized", originally published in the *Asahi Shimbun* on April 6<sup>th</sup>, 1903.

speech.” When it came to Mark Twain’s colloquial style, which was the trend-setter of American literary style reform, the use of the detailed style to translate Twain’s work was literally “anachronistic.” The collision of these two notably different writing styles led to the influential “mistranslation debate,” which in turn led to further reforms of the translation methods and ideas in modern Japan.

### **Wu Tao and the New vernacular style**

Wu Tao’s translation “Adventures in the Mountains” is in new vernacular style. The “new vernacular style” has more colloquial features compared with the “classical Chinese style” (Wenyan wenti) and absorbs vocabulary, grammar, and punctuation from Western languages in comparison with “old vernacular Chinese.” The dominant writing style in modern China changed with the Vernacular Movement starting from 1917. Before 1917, most Chinese texts were written in classical Chinese, while after 1917 writings in vernacular Chinese greatly increased and took up the dominant position. The styles used in translation showed the same trend. Although the Vernacular Movement in the late Qing period played a part in the popularization of the vernacular writing style, before 1917 the main style used in translation was still the classical Chinese style. Wang-chi Wong points out that “As for the translated fiction in late Qing, although [. . . .] there did exist some translated fiction in the vernacular style, classical Chinese still remained the dominant writing style of translated literature. It was always the translated works in classical Chinese that got more attention and wider circulation. They even sold better” (210). Therefore, the new vernacular style used by Wu Tao in 1906 was ahead of the times considering the typical reception of the classical Chinese style. Wu Tao’s bold and innovative choice of style is also what made him a pioneering figure among all the modern Chinese translators.

In the text of “Adventures in the Mountains”, the new vernacular style has two characteristics: colloquial features and the hybridization of different cultures. The colloquial tone is shown in the frequent use of disyllabic or polysyllabic words, reduplicated words and colloquial words. The use of paragraphing, syntax, punctuation, loan words, and expressions from foreign languages shows the translator’s active attempt to embrace foreign linguistic and cultural elements and to incorporate some of them into Chinese writing.

To begin with, Wu Tao turned single character into disyllabic words and double-syllable words into four-syllable words in his translation. The expansion of syllables made the expression more explicit. For example, he translated 「盡くる」 (Tsukuru)

into “淨盡 (Jing jin)”, 「拭ふ」(Nogou) into “拂拭 (Fushi)”, 「燻らす」(Kuyurasu) into “燃吸 (Ranxi)”, 「賑はしき」(Nigihashiki) into “繁盛熱鬧”(Fansheng renao), 「閑雅」(Kanga) into “幽雅清靜 (Youya qingjing).” Although some of them are not exactly what we call “double-syllable words” in contemporary Chinese or what we commonly use today, the expansion of syllables still reveals Wu Tao’s inclination to use polysyllabic words. It is also noteworthy that most four-syllable words used by Wu Tao are not four-character set phrases with strong features of the classical Chinese but made up with simple two-syllable words.

Wu Tao also showed a preference for reduplicated words in his translation. There are words like “悠悠忽忽 (Youyou huhu),” “滔滔娓娓 (Taotao weiwei),” “殷殷勤勤 (Yinyin qinqin),” “欣欣歡喜 (Xinxin huanxi)” in the text. These words add some rhythm and rhyme to the text, similar to the aforementioned repetition of suffix in Mark Twain’s writing. Again, they are simple rhymes found in daily speech rather than features of poetic language.

Wu Tao’s translation also has obvious colloquial features shown in the frequent use of casual words, syntax and modal particles. The colloquial style can be seen clearly from words like “好一箇,” “想是,” “遇着我,” “大大,” “好一会,” “真真,” “今兒,” “九下鐘,” “末了.” Colloquial syntax is used in some sentences which depict the psychological status of characters and convey strong emotions because colloquial expressions tend to convey one’s emotions in a freer way than formal written languages. For instance, in the sentence “我聽了不禁失了大望” (Twain, “Adventures in the Mountains” 3), “失了大望” is typical of daily speech and shows the narrator’s disappointment after knowing that the hostess will not come home soon. Similarly, the sentence “可是大大的遺憾了” (Twain, “Adventures in the Mountains” 3) also intensifies disappointed feelings through the use of colloquial syntax.

The frequent use of modal particles is also an indicator of the colloquial style. There are words including: 喔喔, 哈, 哦哦, 噢噢, 咧, 咦, 嗒, 啊, 啊啊, 麼, 嗎. Some of them are translated from Japanese words with similar sounds. Interrogative auxiliary words 麼, 呢, 啊, 嗎 are translated from 「や」(Ya), 「歟」, 哦哦、噢噢 from 「オ」(O), 啊 from 「よ」(Yo), 啊 and 啊啊 from 「ア」(A). The rest of them were added by Wu Tao. Usually when modal particles are added, they are intended to intensify the emotions that are being described. As shown in the following example, from the modal particles “咦 (Yi)” and “呢 (Ne)” in the translated sentence, we can feel the secret rejoicing and anticipation in the tone of the narrator more directly compared with the original sentence:

此語美なる渠女自身の口より出んには、更に一層吾耳に快かりしならん。

(Twain, “Mountain People’s Love” 277)

咦這話若是出自那女子自己口裏豈不是更叫我快樂萬千呢。(Twain, “Adventures in the Mountains” 3)

Another important feature of the new vernacular style is that it absorbs foreign words, syntax, paragraphing and punctuation. Wu Tao transliterated all the proper nouns in the original text. Originally, these words were transliterated from English into Japanese. Later these names of people, places or brands were again translated into Chinese like “嘉利福尼亞 (Jialifuniya, California),” “奧列貢 (Aoliegong, Oregon),” “布流曼騰山(Buliumantengshan, Blue Mountains),” “阿加希斯樹 (Ajiaxisishu, Agassiz Tree),” “威斯機酒 (Weishijiju, Whiskey),” “杜姆,” “約翰 (Yuehan, John)”.

As for the syntax, most sentences in Wu Tao’s translation have the “Subject-Verb-Object” structure which is the basic sentence structure in English writing. By contrast, the original text, Hara Hōitsuan’s “Mountain People’s Love” is closer to classical Chinese writing with a considerable number of sentences without subjects. Wu Tao added subjects to these sentences in translation, revealing the influence of Western languages.

Traditional Chinese writing has no paragraphs, so Wu Tao’s decision to retain most of the original paragraphing from “Mountain People’s Love” is another example of how translating foreign-language literature contributed to the modernization of Chinese writing.

Similarly, Wu Tao’s innovative spirits were revealed in his use of punctuation. While punctuation was extremely limited in traditional Chinese writing, Wu Tao absorbed several types of punctuation from the Japanese texts in his translation and it is indicated that he could already employ them rather freely. In the text of “Adventures in the Mountains,” four kinds of punctuations are used: “——” “!” “.....”(has not been regulated to be six points)“〔〕”. “——” and “!” are left in their original positions in the translated text. “〔〕”takes the place of “『』”used to quote the contents of the letter. Taking the example of ellipsis, we can see that Wu Tao was able to freely use this punctuation. In “Mountain People’s Love”, there is only one ellipsis: 『吾親愛なる....』 (Twain 278). However, Wu Tao used it for four times in his translation. The original ellipsis was retained, and three more were added, with different functions. The three ellipses and their functions can be seen in the following examples:

然らば御身は渠女を——オ、余はあまり語り過ぎてはならず、(Twain,

“Mountain People’s Love” 276)

但則閣下可.....女子——噢噢非是我言語太誇 (Twain, “Adventures in the Mountains” 2)

In the original text, there is no ellipsis and the dash indicates a shift of topic. However, an ellipsis is added in the translated text. It is possible that Wu Tao saw the sentence before the dash as incomplete with something omitted, so he added an ellipsis to indicate the omission. He also retained the positions of the subject and object in the original sentence and put the ellipsis in the place of the verb between them.

御身、渠女の帰るを待て]

余「御身の妻は只今に居らぬにや、(Twain, “Mountain People’s Love” 277)

閣下且待拙妻回來然後.....我答道。尊妻如今不在家麼。(Twain, “Adventures in the Mountains” 2)

Originally, the sentence ends with “待て,” which indicates the imperative mood. Wu Tao mistook the function of “て” and saw this word as a conjunction. He also took the end of the sentence as an interruption of the host’s speech from another speaker. Therefore, he used an ellipsis to indicate the interruption.

杜牟「御身に差支へなくば」

主人は大事そうに内懷より一通の書状を取出し、(Twain, “Mountain People’s Love” 278)

只聽他應道。你老既不錯誤那.....主人不等說完連忙打懷裏取出一封書信來(Twain, “Adventures in the Mountains” 3)

The ellipsis used here once again indicates the interruption of one’s speech. However, its use also reveals Wu Tao’s misunderstanding of the original text. Tom’s sentence is not complete because Japanese people tend to express their requests in a euphemistic way by omitting the requests when their meaning is clear to other people. Here an ellipsis can be added to indicate the omission. However, Wu Tao added “不等說完” after the ellipsis, which means that he intended to use it to show the interruption of words. In addition, Wu Tao mistranslated a word. The meaning of 「差支へなく」 was mistaken. Wu Tao mistranslated it into “不錯誤” while the right translation should be “不介意”.

Although sometimes Wu Tao misunderstood the original text, the four ellipses and their different functions in the text reveal his mastery of the use of this punctuation. The introduction of modern punctuation from foreign languages into Chinese writing is one important characteristic of the new vernacular style.

### **Relay Translation through Japanese and Chinese Style Reform**

Wu Tao's translation was based on Hara Hōitsuan's "Mountain People's Love" in the detailed style, but he chose to use the new vernacular style. His choice was closer to the colloquial style of Mark Twain's original text. Could it have been possible that Wu Tao knew about the style of Mark Twain's writing in advance so that he attempted to represent the colloquial style in his translation? Not really; in view of Wu Tao's translation experiences and the reception history of Mark Twain in China, it was impossible for Wu Tao to grasp Mark Twain's writing style before his translation.

Wu Tao might not have been a very productive translator in modern Chinese translation history, but the diversity of his translations was absolutely remarkable. Here diversity means that he translated works by multiple writers from different countries. During the years between 1903 and 1913, Wu translated twenty-four works of fiction by different writers from seven countries including Germany, England, America, Japan, Russia, Poland and France (Cui 92). Except for works written in Japanese, which were direct translations, he translated all of the fiction written in other languages indirectly through their Japanese translations. Therefore, all of Wu Tao's translations were based on Japanese texts. This indicates that he only knew Japanese and he was incapable of reading Mark Twain's original text, let alone grasping his writing style. According to the catalogue by Tarumoto Teruo, "Adventures in the Mountains" was the only work of Mark Twain translated by Wu Tao, again showing that his contact with Mark Twain's writing was limited. In addition, Mark Twain was only introduced to Chinese readers after 1905 when Yan Tong introduced Mark Twain in a detailed way in the afterword of his translation of Mark Twain's "the Czar's Soliloquy" —"the Czar's Soliloquy" (E'huang duyū). In this passage, Yan Tong transcribed Mark Twain as "马可曲恒 (Makequheng)". However, Wu Tao transcribed the name as "马克多槐 (Makeduohuai)," different from Yan Tong's transcription. This fact rules out the possibility that Wu Tao knew about Mark Twain's writing style through Yan Tong's introduction. Therefore, it can be concluded that Wu Tao's decision to translate Mark Twain's colloquial style into the new vernacular style was merely a coincidence. Wu Tao could only read Hara

Hōitsuan's translated text in the detailed style and his choice of style was contrary to Hara's. This hints at the fact that, similar to Hara Hōitsuan, Wu Tao also lacked a conscious understanding of the original style, and that he chose the new vernacular style for other purposes.

As mentioned before, Wu Tao's choice of style was ahead of its time. His choice of the new vernacular style could be explained to be due to his radical ideas and his intention to enlighten the masses. Although there remains much uncertainty about Wu Tao's biographical information, the limited historical records show that he was a versatile man of letters. He was not only a translator, but also a calligrapher, a textbook editor and a teacher. Apart from working at the Commercial Press as a translator, he also taught in a modern school called "Patriotic School (Aiguo xueshe)". According to the memories of Jiang Weiqiao,

At the time, Cai Jiemin established the Patriotic School. Zhang consulted with Cai as his good friend. Cai put forward the suggestion: Since translation seemed useless, what about abandoning it and compiling primary school textbooks instead? ...Cai thus selected several teachers to compile textbooks of Chinese, History, Geography and other subjects. Yu was responsible for the Chinese textbooks, Wu Danchu was for History and the original editor Yao was for Geography. (396)

"Danchu" was the style name of Wu Tao. Since Wu Tao was a teacher of the modern school—Patriotic School which advocated patriotism, democracy and revolution, it was highly possible that Wu Tao personally believed in values which could be called radical at the time. Revolution could not succeed without the support from the masses. To mobilize them, enlightenment was a necessary task for intellectuals like Wu Tao. Whether as a teacher or a translator, Wu Tao shouldered the responsibility of enlightening the masses. Vernacular writing was a good tool for enlightenment, which explained for Wu Tao's choice of the new vernacular style in translation. According to the foreword of the magazine *Tapestry Portrait Novel* in which "Adventures in the Mountains" was published, the purpose of translating foreign fiction was to enlighten all the ignorant people. Wu Tao's new vernacular style in translation served the same purpose.

With innovative spirit and the responsibility of enlightening the masses in mind, Wu Tao translated all foreign texts through "word-for-word translation" (Zhuzi yi) in order to push Chinese writing style reform forward by absorbing foreign linguistic elements. Although Wu Tao failed to represent the original style



in his translation, his new vernacular style formed by the literal translation of the detailed style was already a modern style compared with classical Chinese or old vernacular Chinese, setting the trend for the literary style reform in modern China. The new vernacular style directly absorbed some Japanese language features from the detailed style and indirectly absorbed elements of Western syntax found in the Japanese text.

Thus a literal translation of a rather conservative Japanese writing style could help to form a new style in modern China. Considering the prevalence of relay translation through Japanese in modern China, its influence on Chinese style reform should not be underestimated. During the late Qing and early republican period, relay translation through Japanese was common among Chinese translators because of the limited number of translators proficient in other foreign languages. At the time Japan was an important destination for Chinese students to study abroad. The relatively close relationship between Japanese language and Chinese language also made it easier for Chinese to learn Japanese. Thus the Japanese language became a useful intermediary for Chinese people to learn about European-American literatures and cultures. Japanese also played an important part in the Europeanization of Chinese language by serving as an intermediary in the relay translation. However, this phenomenon has not received enough scholarly attention, as stated by Chen Liwei who calls for further exploration of Japanese's role in Chinese language reform:

As for what we call “Europeanization” (of the Chinese language), how much of it directly came from the influence of English language? How much from the relay translation through Japanese? How much in fact directly from Japanese language? Each of these three channels of Europeanization should be clarified. Especially the latter two channels, should have caught our attention earlier. (43)

Relay translation through Japanese contributed to the new vernacular style's absorption of Western and Japanese linguistic elements. One premise for this phenomenon is that Japanese style reform was earlier than that in modern China so that Japanese language was Europeanized first. However, it is noteworthy that this phenomenon also has profound historical roots in the intimate interaction between Chinese and Japanese languages that can be traced back to ancient times. Chinese characters used to be the *lingua franca* in East Asia. Although Japanese was reformed earlier and the influence of Chinese writing upon it was largely

reduced with the Europeanization, the common use of Chinese characters by these two languages is what made possible the popularity of relay translations through Japanese in modern China.

---

### Works Cited:

---

- Bridgman, Richard. *The Colloquial Style in America*. New York: Oxford UP, 1966. Print.
- Bulwer-Lytton, Edward. リットン. *Saint or Bandit* 聖人か盗賊か (Seijin ka tōzoku ka). Trans. Hara Hōitsuan原抱 一庵. Tokyo: Kinkodō shoten, 1903. Print.
- Chen, Liwei 陳力衛. “The Influence of Japanese language on the Modern Chinese Writing Style” 試論近代漢語文體中的日語影響 (Shilun jindai hanyu wenti zhong de riyu yingxiang). *Tō Asia bunka cōsatsu kenkū: bessatsu* 7(2011): 43-53. Print.
- Cowley, M. “The middle American Style: Davy Crockett to E. Hemingway.” *New York Times Book Review* 15 July 1945: 3-14. Print.
- Cui, Qi 崔琦. “Wu Tao’s Translation Activities and the Japanese magazine *Taiyō*” 吳禱的翻譯活動與日本《太陽》雜誌 (Wu Tao de fanyi huodong yu riben taiyang zazhi). *Qinghua daxue xuebao (zhexue shehui kexueban)* 28.1(2013): 91-97. Print.
- Jiang, Weiqiao 蔣維喬. “The Commercial Press and the Zhonghua Book Company in the Initial Phase” 創辦初期之商務印書館與中華書局 (Chuangbian chuqi zhi shangyu yinshuguan yu zhonghua shuju). *The Historical Records of Chinese Modern Publishing: the 4<sup>th</sup> Volume of the Modern Period (Part II)* 中國近現代出版史料·現代丁編(下) (zhongguo jindai chuban shiliao: xiandai dingbian (xia)). Ed. Zhang Jinglu 張靜廬. Shanghai: Shanghai shudian chubanshe, 2003. 395-399. Print.
- Kaji, Nobuyuki 加地 伸行. *The Basics of Chinese Grammars* 漢文法基礎 (Kanbunpō kiso). Tokyo: Kōdan sha, 2010. Print.
- Kawato, Michiaki 川戶 道昭. “Hara Hōitsuan in His Late Years—the Full Story of the Mistranslation Debat—” 晩年の原抱一庵——誤訳論争のあとさき—— (Bannen no Hara Hōitsuan—gouaku ronsō). *The Complete Works of Translated Literature in Meiji Era, the 20<sup>th</sup> Volume of the News Magazines : The Works of Mark Twain* 明治翻訳文学全集·新聞雑誌編20 マーク・トウェイン集 (Meiji honyayu bungaku zenshū: shimbun zasshi hen 20 Mark Twain shū). Ed. Kawato Michiaki 川戶 道昭 and Takanori Sakakibara 榊原 貴教. Tokyo: Ozora sha, 1996. 351-356. Print.
- Mizuno, Akira 水野 的. “A Preliminary Study of the Stylistic Norms in the Early Meiji Period” 明治初期の翻訳文体規範——予備的考察 (Meiji shoki no honyaku buntai kihan—yobi no kōsatsu). *Honyaku kenkū he no shōtai* 5(2011): 1-24. Print.
- Shangwu Yinshuguan Zhuren 商務印書館主人. “The Reasons for Us to Publish *Xiuxiang*

- Xiaohuo*” 本館編印繡像小説緣起 (Benguan bianyin xiuxiang xiaoshuo yuanqi). *Xiuxiang xiaoshuo*, 1(1903).
- Takahashi, Osamu高橋 修. “The Translation in the Detailed style by Morita Shiken” 森田思軒の<周密>訳 (Morita Shiken no shūmitsu buntai). *A New Collection of Japanese Classical Literature, the 15<sup>th</sup> Volume of the Meiji Period: Collected Works of Translated Fiction II* 新日本古典文學大系明治編15 翻訳小説集二 (Shin nihon koten bungaku taikai Meiji hen 15 honyaku shōsetsu shū ni). Ed. Oka Teruo岡 照雄, et al. Tokyo: Iwanami shōten, 2002. 555-564. Print.
- Tarumoto, Teruo樽本照雄. “The Catalogue of Wu Tao’s Translations” 吳禱翻訳目録 (Go Tō honyaku mokuroku). *Shinmatsu shōsetsu kara* 10 (1988): n. pag. Web. 10 Jul, 2019.
- Trilling, Lionel. *The Liberal Imagination*. New York: The Viking P, 1950. Print.
- Twain, Mark. “The Californian’s Tale.” *The Complete Short Stories of Mark Twain*. Ed. Charles Neider. New York: Doubleday, Doran & Company, Inc., 1957. 266-272. Print.
- 马克多槐. “Adventures in the Mountains” 山家奇遇 (Shanjia qiyu). Trans. Wu Tao吳禱. *Xiuxiang xiaoshuo* 70(1906):1-5. Print.
- 马可曲恒. “the Czar’s Soliloquy” 俄皇獨語 (E’huang duyū). Trans. Yan Tong 嚴通. *Zhixue bao* 2(1905): 37-49. Print.
- マーク・トウェイン. “Mountain People’s Love” 山家の戀 (Yamaga no Koi). Trans. Hara Hōitsuan原抱 一庵. *The Complete Works of Translated Literature in Meiji Era, the 20<sup>th</sup> Volume of the News Magazines : The Works of Mark Twain* 明治翻訳文学全集・新聞雑誌編20 マーク・トウェイン集 (Meiji honyayu bungaku zenshū: shimbun zasshi hen 20 Mark Twain shū). Ed. Kawato Michiaki川戸 道昭 and Takanori Sakakibara榊原 貴教. Tokyo: Ozora sha, 1996. 275-280. Print.
- マーク・トウェイン. “A Strange Story on the Foot of the Rocky Mountains” 落機山下の一怪譚 (Rokkīmaunten no shita no kimyō na hanashi). Trans. Hara Hōitsuan原抱 一庵. *The Complete Works of Translated Literature in Meiji Era, the 20<sup>th</sup> Volume of the News Magazines : The Works of Mark Twain* 明治翻訳文学全集・新聞雑誌編20 マーク・トウェイン集 (Meiji honyayu bungaku zenshū: shimbun zasshi hen 20 Mark Twain shū). Ed. Kawato Michiaki川戸 道昭 and Takanori Sakakibara榊原 貴教. Tokyo: Ozora sha, 1996. 296-311. Print.
- マーク・トウェイン. “Advice” 助言 (Jogen). Trans. Hara Hōitsuan原抱 一庵. *The Complete Works of Translated Literature in Meiji Era, the 11<sup>th</sup> Volume of the Translators: The Works of Hara Hōitsuan* 明治翻訳文学全集・翻訳家編11 原抱 一庵集 (Meiji honyayu bungaku zenshū: honyakuka hen 11 Hara Hōitsuan shū). Ed. Kawato Michiaki 川戸 道昭 and Takanori Sakakibara榊原 貴教. Tokyo: Ozora sha, 2003. 128-133. Print.
- マーク・トウェイン. *The Killing of Caesar* 該撤殺害 (Shīzā satsugai). Trans. Yamagata

- Isoo 山県 五十雄. Tokyo: Genbun sha, 1903. Print.
- Wong, Wang-chi王宏志. *Between Translation and Literature* 翻譯與文學之間 (Fanyi yu wenxue zhijian). Nanjing: Nanjing daxue chubanshe, 2010. Print.
- Yanagida, Izumi柳田 泉. *A Study of Translated Literature in the Early Meiji Period* 明治初期翻譯文學の研究 (Meiji shoki honyaku bungaku no kenkū). Tokyo: Shunjū sha, 1961. Print.

---

**Author Profile:**

---

Li Xuezhao is a PhD candidate of the Department of East Asian Languages and Literatures at the Ohio State University. Her main research interests include literary translation in Late Qing and early Republican China, modern Chinese literature and culture in transcultural, transnational, translingual dimensions. She has published works including “New Possibilities of Literary History: An Analysis of Two Western Works about Chinese Literary History” and “On the Translation of *Hong Lou Meng* by Jorge Luis Borges”. Her paper “Contextualization and Presence: the Pursuit of Truth in B. S. McDougall’s Contemporary Chinese Literary Studies” is collected in the forthcoming edited volume *Sinologists and Contemporary Chinese Literature Studies*.